

**University of Mississippi
Surgery**

Analysis of Trainee Comments

Subject: Joseph E. Papin, IV
Time Period: 07/01/2016 to 06/22/2017
Time Period Type: Request Date
Report Date: 06/22/2017

EXHIBIT

10

exhibitsticker.com

Surgery: Care for Diseases and Conditions

The resident appropriately evaluates, diagnoses and develops a management plan (including initial evaluation and management of post-operative complications) commensurate with their level of experience.

<p>Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 09/01/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Lawrence Creswell, Assoc. Professor</p>	During outpatient clinic sessions, Joe did a very good job with initial evaluations of cardiac surgery patients--both pre-surgery and post-surgery.
<p>Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 09/03/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Pierre de Delva, Attending Physician</p>	Joe did a reasonable Job in clinic but he failed to demonstrate that he owned the care of the inpatients. He often did not seem to have a finger on the pulse of the patients situation. I often discovered issues and problems that I would have expected him to recognize.
<p>Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 10/03/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Gretchen Shull, Health Professional</p>	basic skill and knowledge for patient care was lacking.

Surgery: Care for Diseases and Conditions

The resident maintains professional demeanor, integrity and sense of responsibility in professional relationships and interactions.

<p>Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 08/31/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Jacob Moremen, Assist. Professor</p>	Seen as frequently avoiding duties, not present and accounted for during regular hours
<p>Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 09/01/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Lawrence Creswell, Assoc. Professor</p>	In my personal interactions with Joe, I have not seen problems in this area, but I have had several negative reports from other, non-physician, members of our team. In particular, I've heard reports of things that were deemed "not my job" and incomplete follow-up with assigned tasks as well as general problems relating professionally to other non-physician team members.
<p>Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 09/03/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Pierre de Delva, Attending Physician</p>	Several team members commented on failure to develop rapport and trust with nurses and nurse practitioners. At times he was seen as dismissive and above doing certain work. I did not see this personally but heard back from team members. I am afraid that if this is an ongoing issue, he will undermine his ability to be a good team leader as he rises in the program. He needs to develop some awareness and insight on how he is perceived by others.
<p>Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 10/03/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Gretchen Shull, Health Professional</p>	I found him disrespectful to nurses and female support staff. I didn't appreciate it when he would talk to me with his back turned.

Surgery: Care for Diseases and Conditions

The resident demonstrates effective interpersonal and communication skills that result in effective information exchange with their patients and their patients' families.

Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 08/31/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Jacob Moremen, Assist. Professor	Abysmal communicator. Complaints numerous
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 09/01/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Lawrence Creswell, Assoc. Professor	I've seen only positive information exchange between Joe and patients/families. I've heard reports, though, of interpersonal and communications skills, generally, that were less than satisfactory.

Surgery: Performance of Operations and Procedures

The resident demonstrates knowledge of operative procedures, technical skill, tissue handling and proficiency with instrumentation appropriate for their level of experience.

Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 09/01/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Lawrence Creswell, Assoc. Professor	I've had little opportunity to observe performance of operations and procedures.
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 09/03/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Pierre de Delva, Attending Physician	on the limited interactions we had in the or, he did well.
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 09/16/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Penny Vance, Health Professional	Rotation goal at PGY1/intern level was to learn surgical care (CT speciality) in participating in clinic seeing patients and rounding on floor with patients, and proper documentation. Goal at this time was not specifically to participate in surgical procedures, although intern could if he/she had time once his other responsibilities were completed. Was however observed with a higher level resident in placing a sterile dressing post sterile procedure on a patient, and observer (Nurse educator for unit) offered to teach intern how to properly apply a sterile dressing using sterile technique. The nurse educator reported intern replied that he didn't need to know how to do that.
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 10/09/2016 Activity: VA Evaluator: Kenneth Vick, Assoc. Professor	i did not work with him in the OR

Surgery: Performance of Operations and Procedures

The resident communicates effectively, efficiently and professionally in the operating room.

Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 09/01/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Lawrence Creswell, Assoc. Professor	I've had little opportunity to observe performance of operations and procedures.
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 09/16/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Penny Vance, Health Professional	Did not personally observe intern in OR, as this was not the goal of this rotation (as a PGY-2 his focus on CT surgery rotation will purely be to participate in surgical procedures and complete consults). I did instruct on procedure and was present and he did follow instructions well in this instance. However, in several instances was instructed by myself and fellow to perform a procedure (after I signed out for the day) and he failed to perform the procedure as ordered by the attending, so it did not get done. Also, I offered to show him how to perform the procedure and he walked off, stating he would ask the fellow if he needed to do this. I spoke with fellow and he advised that he directed him to perform the procedure (was a twice daily medication dosing via chest tube and I had performed the am procedure, and the pm procedure fell at a time after I leave in afternoon).
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 10/03/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Gretchen Shull, Health Professional	NA - I didn't have any experience with him in the OR.

Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 10/09/2016 Activity: VA Evaluator: Kenneth Vick, Assoc. Professor	i did not work with him in the OR
Surgery: Coordination of Care	
The resident understands and effectively utilizes resources available to ensure appropriate management of their patients and effectively communicates with the care team.	
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 09/01/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Lawrence Creswell, Assoc. Professor	There have been issues with care coordination, particularly for the general thoracic surgery patients. Drs. De Delva and Moremen will be in a better position to offer specific comments.
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 09/16/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Penny Vance, Health Professional	Did not communicate with CT team well, was advised first day of rotation what his responsibilities were by attending staff, and did not report to Cardiac Surgery Clinic on days responsible, as well as on multiple occasions, asking another team member perform (his) duties that he did not want to perform.
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 10/03/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Gretchen Shull, Health Professional	poor communicator to the team about patient plans.
Surgery: Improvement of Care	
The resident understands health care delivery and critically evaluates self and system for opportunities to improve delivery of patient care.	
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 09/01/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Lawrence Creswell, Assoc. Professor	I'm concerned that Joe did not respond well to feedback from Dr. Earl regarding difficulties during his July rotation in the CICU....and some of these problems persisted during this rotation.
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 09/03/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Pierre de Delva, Attending Physician	Again the feedback from non physician team members is that Joe appears burdened to interact them and take into consideration their opinion and experience.
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 10/03/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Gretchen Shull, Health Professional	poor insight to his own behavior.
Surgery: Teaching	
The resident recognizes teachable moments and demonstrates an effective teaching style.	
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 09/01/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Lawrence Creswell, Assoc. Professor	I've had little opportunity for observation in this regard.

Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 10/03/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Gretchen Shull, Health Professional	would be late to clinic or not show up entirely and even sometimes just disappear.
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 10/09/2016 Activity: VA Evaluator: Kenneth Vick, Assoc. Professor	i did not get any feedback regarding this
Surgery: Self-Directed Learning	
The resident actively engages in self-directed learning using level appropriate resources.	
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 08/31/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Jacob Moremen, Assist. Professor	Seemed almost never to be prepared or recall facts from previous discussions
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 09/01/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Lawrence Creswell, Assoc. Professor	I've had little opportunity for observation in this regard.
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 09/16/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Penny Vance, Health Professional	Did not personally observe intern engaging in self-directed learning activities.
Surgery: Performance of Assignments and Administrative Tasks	
The resident is prompt and attentive to detail in completion of assigned tasks including conference presentations, education and patient care activites.	
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 08/31/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Jacob Moremen, Assist. Professor	Had to be reoriented to missed details almost daily.
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 09/01/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Lawrence Creswell, Assoc. Professor	This is a mix of good and bad. On the good side, for instance, Joe prepared well for our monthly Journal Club and was an active participant. On the bad side, though, there have been problems with patient care follow-up as well as absence at assigned clinic activities.
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 09/03/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Pierre de Delva, Attending Physician	I focus here mainly on the patient care side of activities. Our service is complex but not burdened with a lot of patients. We have high expectations of the residents and their ability work efficiently and stay on top of all the patient care issues. Joe struggled some with this and often seemed overwhelmed.
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 10/03/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Gretchen Shull, Health Professional	did not follow instructions regarding communicating discharges, and follow up instructions to our team.
Surgery: Comments:	

Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 08/19/2016 Activity: CVICU Evaluator: Jay Shake, Assist. Professor	Bright, articulate, and eager to learn and provide good care to his patients. This was his first month in his internship and there was some growing pain in how an intern/resident fits in a critical care TEAM including a number of Advanced Practice Providers (nurse practitioners) and medical students. This led to some misunderstandings and frustration from nearly all of the ICU team. On a positive note, I believe this was a learning experience and I have heard that there was resolution. How he handled the situation was a testament to his willingness to work out uncomfortable situations and succeed in his medical education and training.
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 08/30/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Giorgio Aru, Assoc. Professor	I have interacted with him marginally since he rotated a lot with General Thoracic Surgery. He was always present at rounds and I think that he learned a lot.
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 09/01/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Lawrence Creswell, Assoc. Professor	I see some really good things here: positive attitude, friendly nature, bright, knowledgeable. But there have also been issues with professionalism that get in the way of an overall positive experience. Joe should give serious thought to this issue because it will really hinder progress.
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 09/01/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Irion Walker, PGY2	.
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 09/03/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Pierre de Delva, Attending Physician	Joe seems to be a good person and capable of being a good resident. I think there is a disconnect between the wanting to be a surgeon and understanding the path to get there. I hope this is just difficulty adjusting to the reality of residency training and entering the clinical environment. I hope he will take the feedback given in this rotation constructively. Otherwise, I can envision him becoming increasingly frustrated and marginalized by those he will need to be successful in training.
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 09/16/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Penny Vance, Health Professional	Very disappointed with this intern's performance on CT surgery rotation. Would expect an intern being accepted to our general surgery residency to be the "cream of the crop" as is very competitive. On a positive note, his documentation was actually better than expected for an intern.
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 10/03/2016 Activity: Cardiothoracic Surgery Evaluator: Gretchen Shull, Health Professional	he has set the bar quite low for the general surgery residency here at UMMC. he seems to be un-teachable and lacks a general awareness of professionalism. he lacked an understanding of basic care, but refused to admit his shortcomings, and was consistently playing the blame-game when he was approached. it was a bad experience to work alongside him.
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 10/09/2016 Activity: VA Evaluator: Kenneth Vick, Assoc. Professor	there were issues at the beginning of the rotation of him not having his assigned tasks completed so he was ready to go. This was an issue with the other residents on service. My expectation is that this will not be a trend and that he will improve upon this as he becomes familiar with our system.
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 10/17/2016 Activity: VA Evaluator: Barney Nicholson, Attending Physician	Joe did an excellent job during this rotation. He should continue to read and practice suture and knot tying.
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 11/16/2016 Activity: VA Evaluator: Rajesh Kuruba, Assist. Professor	Joe is pleasant, hard working and sincere resident. He has adequate knowledge base and has room for improvement. He is enthusiastic and eager to learn. His operating skills are on par with his PGY level.
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 11/29/2016 Activity: General Surgery B Evaluator: Kenneth Vick, Assoc. Professor	I did not get a chance to work with Dr Papin very much this rotation, but reportedly his performance was improved according to team members and he spent a good deal of time in clinic. I did not get to evaluate his operative skills.

Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 11/29/2016 Activity: General Surgery B Evaluator: Cheryl McCoy, Health Professional	Would like to see more communication with the entire team and also be available to assist with floor needs : ie, sign prescriptions in a timely manner
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 12/10/2016 Activity: General Surgery B Evaluator: Jon Harrison, PGY3	Intelligent, knowledgable about patients and treatment plans. Needs to work on communication with nursing staff and students. Can be rude/condescending at times.
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 12/15/2016 Activity: General Surgery B Evaluator: Shawn McKinney, Assoc. Professor	Needs to read more to begin to formulate plans for patients
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 01/09/2017 Activity: Trauma Evaluator: Lonnie Frei, Assoc. Professor	Very limited exposure during the trauma rotation, with most encounters only during on call overnight. Seems on level.
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 04/20/2017 Activity: Trauma Evaluator: Kelly Brister, PGY2	Poor job in attention to detail and in evaluating the patient as a whole. Did not demonstrate professionalism in communication with nurses and other members of team.
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 06/08/2017 Activity: Hepatobiliary/Transplant Evaluator: Mark Earl, Assist. Professor	Below average performance, serious concerns surrounding professionalism.

Surgery: Care for Diseases and Conditions

The resident maintains professional demeanor, integrity and sense of responsibility in professional relationships and interactions.

Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 06/08/2017 Activity: Hepatobiliary/Transplant Evaluator: Mark Earl, Assist. Professor	difficult relationships with those around him. Abrasive much of the time. Gives a condescending impression.
--	---

Surgery: Performance of Operations and Procedures

The resident communicates effectively, efficiently and professionally in the operating room.

Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 06/08/2017 Activity: Hepatobiliary/Transplant Evaluator: Mark Earl, Assist. Professor	Generally disliked by OR staff, generally due to a condescending tone and unwillingness to accept instruction.
--	--

Surgery: Performance of Assignments and Administrative Tasks

The resident is prompt and attentive to detail in completion of assigned tasks including conference presentations, education and patient care activites.

Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 06/08/2017 Activity: Hepatobiliary/Transplant Evaluator: Mark Earl, Assist. Professor	tasks often left incomplete.
--	------------------------------

Surgery: List all of your presentations, posters, papers, book chapters, etc. that you have completed:

Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 11/28/2016 Activity: Resident Self Evaluation Evaluator: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1	None this year, so far. I imagine this question is asking about this year or residency in total.
Surgery: What is your study source for general surgical knowledge development?	
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 11/28/2016 Activity: Resident Self Evaluation Evaluator: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1	Absite Review The ICU Book Schwartz/Greenfield
Surgery: How do you allocate time for studying?	
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 11/28/2016 Activity: Resident Self Evaluation Evaluator: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1	One hour per day minimum, not including mini-study sessions on conditions with which I am not familiar. I generally find time during the day or after sign-out to study.
Surgery: What do you do to maintain a healthy mind and body?	
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 11/28/2016 Activity: Resident Self Evaluation Evaluator: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1	I lift like a prisoner and run like I stole. Engaging with family and friends rounds out the rest.
Surgery: Do you exercise regularly?	
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 11/28/2016 Activity: Resident Self Evaluation Evaluator: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1	Twice daily, every day
Surgery: What is your "outlet" outside the hospital?	
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 11/28/2016 Activity: Resident Self Evaluation Evaluator: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1	The gym, running, prison rules basketball, hanging out with friends and family, binge watching television on my days off, and reading (both for pleasure and education).
Surgery: How are you doing with time management?	
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 11/28/2016 Activity: Resident Self Evaluation Evaluator: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1	Great
Surgery: How are you doing with efficiency?	

Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 11/28/2016 Activity: Resident Self Evaluation Evaluator: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1	Great
Surgery: How are you doing with inter-professional and patient/family interactions?	
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 11/28/2016 Activity: Resident Self Evaluation Evaluator: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1	Patient/family interactions- very good Inter-professional- Residents/faculty- also very good Nurses/mid-level providers evidently find me aloof and "above certain tasks"
Surgery: How are you doing with technical skill?	
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 11/28/2016 Activity: Resident Self Evaluation Evaluator: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1	Learning every day
Surgery: How are you doing with professionalism?	
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 11/28/2016 Activity: Resident Self Evaluation Evaluator: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1	Save for a very select few set of interactions, I have always had positive interactions with patients and staff.
Surgery: How are you doing with medical knowledge?	
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 11/28/2016 Activity: Resident Self Evaluation Evaluator: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1	Great
Surgery: How are you doing with educating those junior to you?	
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 11/28/2016 Activity: Resident Self Evaluation Evaluator: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1	I'm getting better. I try to take the time every day to explain the science/thought behind what we are doing and answer any questions the medical students may have. I'd like to get to the point to where I'm giving regular, prepared mini-lectures on useful surgical topics for third year medical students.
Surgery: How have you improved over the past 6 months?	
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 11/28/2016 Activity: Resident Self Evaluation Evaluator: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1	I've become much more knowledgeable, my efficiency has grown exponentially, and I'm working to become more extroverted.
Surgery: What are your weaknesses and what are your plans to improve them?	

Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 11/28/2016 Activity: Resident Self Evaluation Evaluator: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1	I'm very quiet when I initially meet people. I'm learning that comes off to nurses and mid-level providers as me being aloof and "above" certain tasks/them. Though I've never declined a task or avoided work, it would seem to behoove me to work to be more outgoing.
Surgery: What are your strengths and how do you capitalize on them?	
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 11/28/2016 Activity: Resident Self Evaluation Evaluator: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1	Generally confident, aware of my boundaries, and hard-working. I push myself as far as is safe for patient care.
Surgery: What are your goals?	
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 11/28/2016 Activity: Resident Self Evaluation Evaluator: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1	Affability, availability, and unparalleled ability.
Surgery: What are the barriers to your success?	
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 11/28/2016 Activity: Resident Self Evaluation Evaluator: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1	Nobody gives direct feedback. I seem to have had some issues with "controversy," but I've never been spoken to by anybody other than the PD. It's incredibly difficult to use feedback from third-hand information.
Surgery: How can the program help you ensure success?	
Subject: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1 Date: 11/28/2016 Activity: Resident Self Evaluation Evaluator: Joseph Papin, IV, PGY1	1) Work on the culture of feedback in the program. I'm now 5 months into the program and I've received face-to-face feedback from somebody other than the Program Director exactly once. The feedback given in person and the feedback written in evaluations were starkly different. 2) Encourage nurses, mid-level providers, and faculty to speak directly to a resident should they have a concern. A culture where somebody speaks two levels above you and you're forced to get feedback from someone who was never involved in the situation is counterproductive and wastes everybody's time. 3) The program should ensure that feedback is useful, actionable, and accurately reflects what will be written on paper evaluations.